



WHO'S RIGHT?

ORGAN DONATION IN NEW ZEALAND
SOCIAL STUDIES UNIT (NCEA LEVEL 1)



CONTENTS

| | |
|------------------------|----|
| Introduction | 3 |
| Activities | 6 |
| Social Inquiry | 11 |
| Reflection on Learning | 12 |
| Further Resources | 14 |



INTRODUCTION

Organ donation is an important issue, which many New Zealanders don't consider until they require an organ transplant or have to make a decision about whether to donate a family member's organs. Year 11 students will have the opportunity to indicate their wish to be an organ donor when they get their learner driver's licence. This unit provides a good opportunity for students to have conversations at school and at home about their views and the views of their families about organ donation.

This unit follows a social inquiry process to help students understand how people work to promote social justice and human rights within the context of organ donation. As part of their inquiry, students will gather primary evidence through interviewing and surveying and explore how to discuss sensitive issues in an appropriate way.

LINKS TO THE NEW ZEALAND CURRICULUM

VALUES

The values of individuals, the school, and the community are at the heart of curriculum decision making. In this unit, students will be encouraged to value innovation, inquiry, and curiosity; diversity; community and participation; and respect.

Students will consider their own values and develop their ability to express them. They will also learn about and explore, with empathy, the values of others.

KEY COMPETENCIES

The *New Zealand Curriculum* identifies five key competencies that people use to learn, live, work, and contribute as active members of their communities. These competencies are the key to learning in every learning area. Students will have opportunities to use and develop the key competencies as they work through this unit:

- managing self – listening to other viewpoints, completing work
- relating to others – listening to and understanding other people's points of view

- participating and contributing – being able to give a point of view and back it up with evidence
- thinking – considering how people acquire their viewpoints and where different viewpoints come from, deciding what they think about this topic themselves
- using language, symbols, and texts – being able to speak coherently about their point of view, writing about their and other points of view, using graphs, data, and evidence to support their argument.

ACHIEVEMENT OBJECTIVES

This unit aligns with the following achievement objectives from the social sciences learning area at level 6:

- Students will gain knowledge, skills, and experience to understand how individuals, groups, and institutions work to promote social justice and human rights.

It also aligns with the Social Studies Achievement Standard 91040: Conduct a social inquiry.



SOCIAL INQUIRY

“Who’s Right?: Organ Donation in New Zealand” is based on the social inquiry process. This is a process for examining social issues, ideas, and themes in an integrated way. During a social inquiry, students find out information, explore values and perspectives, consider responses and decisions, reflect and evaluate, and communicate what they have learned and what responses they can make. To find out more about using social inquiry, see *Approaches to Social Inquiry* (Ministry of Education, 2008) at Social Sciences Online (<http://ssol.tki.org.nz>).

THE STRUCTURE OF THIS UNIT

This unit consists of an introduction, a social inquiry section, and a follow-up section to reflect on the learning. The introduction explores students’ knowledge about organ donation, people’s points of view about organ donation, people’s rights in relation to organ donation, and the actions people are taking to promote these rights.

IMPORTANT NOTE

Teachers and students need to be aware that some websites promote quite controversial viewpoints. Some organisations promote a view that supports their own personal interest and is not justified by the facts. While students need to draw on a variety of perspectives in their inquiry, please be mindful of possible bias and help them to navigate these viewpoints critically to reach a well-considered conclusion.

CONCEPTUAL UNDERSTANDINGS

Students will understand that:

- people’s values and rights influence their decisions
- human rights can be defined differently by different people
- the rights of individuals may vary
- the decisions that people make about their rights have an impact on their friends, family, and whānau
- different social and cultural beliefs and values can impact on individual decisions.

THE UNIT’S SOCIAL INQUIRY PROCESS

During the inquiry phase, students will learn:

| Social Inquiry | Inquiry Skills |
|--|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how to develop research questions that are open-ended and relevant and that address the social issue • about the concept of social action – what it is, its purpose, and examples of social action • how to consider other people’s points of view on a question, weigh up evidence, and identify the effects of these viewpoints • how our points of view and responses can change depending on the factors that influence us at different times | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how to gather primary data by conducting surveys and interviews • how to work constructively in group situations • how to talk about sensitive topics in an appropriate manner. |

To meet students’ needs and interests, and the intended learning outcomes, you could use the following unit plan or design a programme that incorporates activities from the year 9–10 social studies unit or either of the health education units.



INTRODUCING THE TOPIC OF ORGAN DONATION

ACCESSING PRIOR KNOWLEDGE

Present the following scenario to students:

You are sixteen years old and have just passed the written test for your learner driver's licence. When you complete the form for your driver's licence, one section asks you if you would be willing to donate organs in the event of your death. When you get home, you realise that in the excitement of getting your licence, you can't remember which box you ticked.

Ask students what they think it means to indicate their wish to be an organ donor.

Have students get into small groups and brainstorm what they know about organ donation – for example, what organs are donated, how you indicate your willingness to be a donor, in what circumstances organ donation can happen, and any other aspects of organ donation. Each group can then report back to the class. You could use some of the organ donation resources from the year 9–10 social studies unit.



ACTIVITY 1

SURVEY

EXPLORING VALUES AND PERSPECTIVES

- What are my views on organ donation?

Have students carry out an anonymous survey. Give each student a piece of paper and ask them to write “yes” or “no” to the following question:

- Would you agree to allowing your organs to be donated after your death?

Tally the class results. Keep a record of the results to use in the reflection activity later.

Ask students to find out what having DONOR printed on their driver’s licence actually means. Does it mean that their organs would be automatically donated in the event of their death? (This information can be found at www.nzta.govt.nz/licence/photo/organ-and-tissue-donation.html)

Have students answer the following questions:

- Who gives the final consent to organ donation?
- Do you agree with this? Why or why not?
- Who do you think should make this decision?

ACTIVITY 2

WHAT ARE SOME OF THE ISSUES INVOLVED IN ORGAN DONATION?

FINDING OUT INFORMATION

Give students a copy of Resource 1: In the News, which contains news stories about organ donation. Ask them to choose three news items. They can then use Resource 2: Issues Chart to describe the issue in the news item, what they found out about the issue, and their view of the issue.

RESOURCE LIST

RESOURCE 1: IN THE NEWS
RESOURCE 2: ISSUES CHART



ACTIVITY 3

IT ALL CHANGES IN A MOMENT ...

EXPLORING VALUES AND PERSPECTIVES

- What factors influence our points of view on organ donation?
- Can the factors or my point of view change?

Discuss students' responses to the questions about indicating their willingness to be an organ donor on a driver's licence. Tell students that it is important for people to talk to their families about their wishes relating to organ donation because the immediate family makes the final decision about whether to donate or not. A family who is making a decision about organ donation receives licence details only if they request them.

Point out that our points of view and the decisions we make are influenced by different factors, such as our beliefs, values, and circumstances.

Write "Organ donation" on the board. Add question marks around it. Ask students to brainstorm the factors that might influence their point of view on organ donation, such as a lack of interest, squeamishness, their religious beliefs, or the beliefs and values of their peers and families. Write students' ideas around the question marks.

Now ask students to imagine that their family is deciding whether to donate the organs of a family member. To create a stronger picture in students' minds, describe what the situation might be like and the emotions and tension people would be feeling. Ask students:

- *What would influence your point of view in this situation?*

Students could consider such things as their age in relation to their role in the family's decision making, their relationship to the potential donor, the age of the possible donor, the cause of death, the different emotions (such as anger, pain, and grief) that the family are feeling, and how the request for organ donation was conveyed to the family.

Discuss the similarities and differences of the two brainstorms. Then ask students to write several sentences describing what they have learned about the various points of view and how people's views can differ depending on the circumstances.

ACTIVITY 4

RIGHTS INVOLVED

REFLECTING AND EVALUATING

- Are the rights of any one person (donor, family, recipient, medical staff) more important than the rights of another person?
- How do we decide?

EXPLORING VALUES AND PERSPECTIVES

- Which rights do I value more highly?

Have a discussion with students about people's rights in relation to organ donation, using the information in Resource 3: Concept Map. Tell students that people have different points of view about whose rights are the most important (the would-be donor, their family, or the people whose lives would be saved if the donation went ahead). These rights include:

- the individual's right to have their expressed wish in relation to organ donation acted on
- every individual's right to be fully informed about organ donation (Does a potential donor understand what saying yes or no to organ donation really means? Do the family members who make the final decision fully understand organ donation?)
- the rights of the potential donor's family to say yes or no to the donor's expressed wishes
- the right of the donor to receive full medical support and to be treated with care, dignity, and cultural sensitivity at all times
- the right of the health professionals to behave in accordance with their moral compass
- the possible right of the health professionals to proceed based solely on the potential donor's expressed wish
- the recipient's right to a transplant.

Ask:

- *Which of these rights do you value most?*

In pairs, have students complete a diamond ranking of organ donation rights using Resource 4: The Rights Involved in Organ Donation. They can negotiate the right they think is the most important and the right they think is least important. They can then rank two rights as important and two rights as not very important.

Ask students to explain the reasons for their rankings to the class. Write on the board the top three rights for each group. Then have students group those rights to identify the organ donation values that the class shares.

Revisit the scenario in the introduction but add to it that the applicant indicated their wish to be an organ donor but their family decided not to go ahead with donation. Ask:

- *Which rights are taking precedence here?*
- *Which rights are being overridden?*
- *Whose rights should take precedence? Why?*

Remind students that in New Zealand, the immediate family of a potential donor makes the final decision about donation. The family most commonly complies with what the potential donor has indicated on his or her driver licence, but they do not have to.

RESOURCE LIST

RESOURCE 3: CONCEPT MAP

RESOURCE 4: THE RIGHTS INVOLVED IN ORGAN DONATION



ACTIVITY 5

SOCIAL ACTION

CONSIDERING RESPONSES AND DECISIONS

- What social actions are taken by people with different points of view on organ donation, and what are the rights involved?

Discuss the concept of social action and its intended purpose of raising awareness, instigating change, showing a point of view, or supporting an issue. Ask:

- *How do people promote their rights?*

Encourage students to share their ideas about the ways they have promoted human rights or seen others promoting them – for example, through the actions and choices we make, by talking to people, by donating money to aid organisations, and by presenting petitions to the government to change laws such as those on civil rights.

Tell students that in the social inquiry they will focus on an individual, group, or institution and gather information to discover their point of view on organ donation, which rights they deem most important (if any), and how they work to promote those rights.

In preparation for the inquiry, students could investigate people such as transplant professionals, organisations such as ODNZ, and governments around the world that work to promote rights in organ donation and ensure it is a respectful and confidential process.

SOCIAL INQUIRY

EXPLORING CONCEPTUAL UNDERSTANDINGS:

- How do people define and seek human rights?
- How does cultural interaction affect cultures and societies?

Students will conduct a social inquiry into an individual, group, or institution of their choice that is working to promote human rights in relation to organ donation. Use NCEA resource Social Studies 1.2B: Conduct a Social Inquiry to guide the inquiry. Hand out copies of the NCEA assessment resource as well as Resource 5: Social Inquiry, which contains templates students need to complete. During the three weeks allowed for the assessment, you will need to model the important steps of a social inquiry, such as:

- developing open-ended, relevant research questions that cover the focus of the research
- gathering primary and secondary information by conducting surveys and interviews
- conducting an interview on a sensitive issue (use Resource 6: Suggested Interview Questions, Resource 7: Undertaking Interviews on Sensitive Topics, and Resource 8: Interview Tool – Role Plays)
- using surveying skills (including how to analyse the results)
- identifying examples of social action
- exploring contrasting points of view
- writing a summary of their findings to demonstrate their understanding of the focus of the inquiry
- preparing a reference list.

RESOURCE LIST

RESOURCE 5: SOCIAL INQUIRY
 RESOURCE 6: SUGGESTED INTERVIEW QUESTIONS
 RESOURCE 7: UNDERTAKING INTERVIEWS ON SENSITIVE TOPICS
 RESOURCE 8: INTERVIEW TOOL – ROLE PLAYS



REFLECTION ON LEARNING

ACTIVITY 1

REFLECTING AND EVALUATING

- What have I learned?

SURVEYING STUDENTS' KNOWLEDGE

Give each student a piece of A4 paper and ask them to write their name at the bottom. At the top of the piece of paper, they can write one thing that they have learned during this unit, such as information about the organ donation process, the human rights relating to organ donation, or the different points of view about it.

Ask students to cover their comments by folding over the top edge of the paper. They can then pass their piece of paper to the next student, who repeats the process. Pass the pieces of paper around until each page is full and then return each paper to the student whose name is at the bottom of the page. Students can read the information and tick the things that they now know.

Emphasise to students that they now know a lot more about organ donation than they did at the beginning of this unit. Ask:

- *Have you changed your mind about organ donation and the choice you might make when you get your licence? Why or why not?*

ACTIVITY 2

SO WHAT? NOW WHAT?

- What do we know about this?
- What more could I learn to support me to make a decision about organ donation?

POSTER ACTIVITY

Tell students that New Zealand has a lower donor rate in comparison with other countries in the developed world, in particular Spain, which has one of the highest rates (source: www.donor.co.nz/index.php/statistics/international-donor-rates).

Ask:

- *How do you think we could increase the number of donors in New Zealand? (public awareness campaign, more public information, making the topic a compulsory part of the curriculum, changing the way dying patients are treated in hospital so that more are potential donors)*

To raise awareness and encourage further discussion about organ donation, present the following scenario to students:

You run an advertising agency. Recently there has been a lot of media coverage about a celebrity who has died. Even though the celebrity hadn't indicated her willingness to be a donor on her licence, her family decided to donate her organs.

Organ Donation New Zealand has hired your advertising agency to create a billboard poster. The billboard poster should remind people of the rights of those directly affected in a case of organ donation and/or raise awareness about the subject and the need for people to talk to their families about their wishes.

Have students work in small groups to create a poster. Display the posters around the room and have each group present their poster to the class.

Repeat the anonymous class survey you conducted at the beginning of this unit. Compare the results and see whether they have changed. Prompt students to explain why the results might have changed.

TALKING TO FAMILY

Remind students of the importance of discussing their wishes about organ donation with their families. It is a sensitive subject for many people, and so students need to think about the kind of language they will use and what they will say when they discuss it with their families. (See Resource 7: Undertaking Interviews on Sensitive Topics for ideas on how to do this.)

Students could practise in class the conversations they might have with their families about organ donation.

Allow students a few days to discuss organ donation with their families, then have a follow-up discussion. Ask students about what issues arose, whether talking to their family reinforced or changed their minds about organ donation in some way, or if any family or individual decisions had already been made about indicating a wish to donate.

RESOURCE LIST

RESOURCE 7: UNDERTAKING INTERVIEWS ON SENSITIVE TOPICS



FURTHER RESOURCES

- ODNZ website (www.donor.co.nz)
- ODNZ video clips – interviews with people involved in the organ donor process.
- ODNZ may be able to provide speakers (a member of a donor family, recipient, or staff member) to visit schools that are using this unit. Contact ODNZ through their website to request a speaker.
- The interview with Melanie Stevenson about Facebook’s organ donation initiative: <http://tvnz.co.nz/national-news/facebook-launches-organ-donation-initiative-video-4862546>
- Posters and pamphlets can be ordered through www.donor.co.nz under “Resources”.
- *New Zealand Listener* article “Should NZ consider paying for organs?”, 26 May 2012, at www.listener.co.nz/current-affairs/should-nz-consider-paying-for-body-parts

Other areas that students can investigate include:

- stating your wish to be an organ donor on Facebook
- organ donation policies in different countries, including New Zealand, such as opt in, opt out, or compulsory donation
- celebrities who are connected with organ donation in some way, such as Jonah Lomu or Justin Bieber
- altruistic donation – did you know that you can be a live donor? You can lead a healthy life with only one kidney ... and you can donate part of your liver and that part will regrow! (Recipients do not have a complete liver transplanted.)
- China’s use of executed criminals as a source of organs for transplantation
- black marketing of organs for transplantation (“Chinese boy sells kidney to buy iPad” at www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/china/9191325/Chinese-boy-sells-kidney-to-buy-ipad.html)
- whether live donors should be offered compensation to encourage donation.

Published 2013 for Organ Donation New Zealand by Learning Media Limited,
Box 3293, Wellington 6140, New Zealand.
www.learningmedia.co.nz

Text copyright © Organ Donation New Zealand 2013
All rights reserved. Enquiries should be made to the publisher.

ISBN 978 0 7903 4303 7

